



RFP #:	<u>19-069E</u>	Tentative Board Meeting Date*:	<u>NOVEMBER 7, 2018</u>	
Select One Title:	<u>IDENTITY MANAGEMENT AND SINGLE SIGN-ON SOFTWARE</u>	# Notified:	<u>457</u>	# Downloaded: <u>24</u>
		# of Responses Rec'd:	<u>4</u>	# of "No Bids": <u>1</u>
For:	<u>INFORMATION &amp; TECHNOLOGY</u>	RFP Opening Date :	<u>AUGUST 8, 2018</u>	
	(School/Department)			
Fund:	<u>I&amp;T OPERATING BUDGET</u>	Advertised Date:	<u>JULY 18, 2018</u>	

**POSTING OF Select One RECOMMENDATION/TABULATION:** Select One Recommendations and Tabulations will be posted in the Procurement & Warehousing Services and [www.Demandstar.com](http://www.Demandstar.com) on **OCTOBER 11, 2018 by 3:00 pm** and will remain posted for 72 hours. Any person who is adversely affected by the decision or intended decision shall file a notice of protest, in writing, within 72 hours after the posting of the notice of decision or intended decision. The formal written protest shall be filed within ten (10) days after the date the notice of protest is filed. Failure to file a notice of protest or failure to file a formal written protest shall constitute a waiver of proceedings under this chapter. Section 120.57(3)(b), Florida Statutes, states that "The formal written protest shall state with particularity the facts and law upon which the protest is based." Saturdays, Sundays, state holidays and days during which the District is closed shall be excluded in the computation of the 72-hour time period provided. Filings shall be at the office of the Director of Procurement & Warehousing Services, 7720 West Oakland Park Boulevard, Suite 323, Sunrise, Florida 33351. Any person who files an action protesting an intended decision shall post with the School Board, at the time of filing the formal written protest, a bond, payable to The School Board of Broward County, Florida, (SBBC), in an amount equal to one percent (1%) of the estimated value of the contract. Failure to post the bond required by SBBC Policy 3320, Part VIII, Purchasing Policies, Section N, within the time allowed for filing a bond shall constitute a waiver of the right to protest.

(\* The Cone of Silence, as stated in the ITB / RFP / RFQ / HARD BID, is in effect until it is approved by SBBC. The Board meeting date stated above is tentative. Confirm with the Purchasing Agent of record for the actual date the Cone of Silence has concluded.

**RECOMMENDATION TABULATION**

FOUR PROPOSALS WERE RECEIVED IN RESPONSE TO RFP 19-069E. PROPOSALS WERE EVALUATED BY THE FOLLOWING COMMITTEE MEMBERS CONSISTING OF:

- DR. DARYL DIAMOND – INNOVATIVE LEARNING – DIRECTOR
- JACQUES MENASCHE – I&T – SYSTEM SUPPORT SPECIALIST II, IT SECURITY
- JASON GREENBERG – I&T – SYSTEM ANALYST, TECHNICAL SUPPORT SERVICES
- JEFF STANLEY – I&T – DIRECTOR, SCHOOL APPLICATIONS
- MAXIMO ROSARIO – I&T – DIRECTOR, CLASSROOM TECHNOLOGY & DESKTOP SUPPORT SERVICES
- DR. TONYA FROST – BAYVIEW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL - PRINCIPAL
- KARLENE GRANT – PURCHASING & WAREHOUSING SERVICES – PURCHASING AGENT III (NON-VOTING MEMBER)
- HARMONI CLEALAND – PURCHASING & WAREHOUSING SERVICES – PURCHASING AGENT III (NON-VOTING MEMBER)
- M/WBE ADVISOR – ANNE MARIE RICHARDS

IN ACCORDANCE WITH SECTION 5.1. EVALUATION OF PROPOSALS AND THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE, IT IS RECOMMENDED THAT THE FOLLOWING PROPOSER BE RECOMMENDED FOR APPROVAL BY THE SCHOOL BOARD.

<u>VENDOR NAME(S)</u>	<u>ITEM(S) AWARDED</u>
CLEVER, INC	PRIMARY: GROUP 1
IDENTITY AUTOMATION	PRIMARY: GROUP 2 ALTERNATE: GROUP 1

CONTRACT PERIOD: UPON APPROVAL BY THE SCHOOL BOARD THROUGH JUNE 30, 2022

By:  Date: October 11, 2018  
(Purchasing Agent)

The School Board of Broward County, Florida, prohibits any policy or procedure which results in discrimination on the basis of age, color, disability, gender expression, national origin, marital status, race, religion, sex or sexual orientation. Individuals who wish to file a discrimination complaint, may call the Executive Director, Benefits & EEO Compliance at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.

Individuals with disabilities requesting accommodations under the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) may call the Equal Educational Opportunities (EEO) at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.



19-069E  
**GROUP 2 BID REJECTIONS**

**REJECT BID FROM CLEVER AND CLASSLINK**

CLEVER, INC AND CLASSLINK, INC BOTH INDICATED THAT THEY COMPLY WITH ALL MINIMUM REQUIREMENTS IN THEIR PROPOSAL RESPONSES. HOWEVER, DURING THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEETING, IT WAS REVEALED THAT THIS IS NOT THE CASE. AS A RESULT, THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE CALLED ALL VENDORS TO CONFIRM YEARS OF EXPERIENCE.

THE EVALUATION COMMITTEE DETERMINED THAT CLEVER, INC HAS ZERO (0) YEARS EXPERIENCE IMPLEMENTING IDENTITY MANAGEMENT AND CLASSLINK, INC HAS ONE (1) YEAR EXPERIENCE IMPLEMENTING IDENTITY MANAGEMENT. THEREFORE, BOTH PROPOSERS DID NOT MEET THE MINIMUM YEARS OF EXPERIENCE IMPLEMENTING AND SUPPORTING IDENTITY MANAGEMENT, WHICH CAUSES THEM TO BE NON-RESPONSIVE AND DISQUALIFIED FOR FAILURE TO COMPLY WITH SECTION 4.2 OF THE RFP.

**AS STATED IN SECTION 4.2:**

**MINIMUM ELIGIBILITY:** IN ORDER TO BE CONSIDERED FOR AWARD AND TO BE FURTHER EVALUATED, PROPOSER MUST MEET OR EXCEED THE FOLLOWING CRITERIA AS OF THE OPENING DATE OF THE PROPOSAL.

**AS STATED IN SECTION 4.2.2:**

**PROPOSER MUST HAVE A MINIMUM OF FIVE (5) YEARS IN BUSINESS IMPLEMENTING AND SUPPORTING IDM AND SSO SOLUTION**

The School Board of Broward County, Florida, prohibits any policy or procedure which results in discrimination on the basis of age, color, disability, gender expression, national origin, marital status, race, religion, sex or sexual orientation. Individuals who wish to file a discrimination complaint, may call the Executive Director, Benefits & EEO Compliance at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.

Individuals with disabilities requesting accommodations under the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) may call the Equal Educational Opportunities (EEO) at 754-321-2150 or Teletype Machine (TTY) at 754-321-2158.



THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA  
TABULATION SHEET

RFP Number: 19-069E  
RFP Title: IDM & SSO  
Group 1 - Single Sign On  
Purchasing Agent Name: **Karlene Grant**  
Date Opened: August 8, 2018 August  
Evaluation Meeting 29, 2018

Proposer's Name	Evaluation Points	Recommended for Award
ClassLink, Inc	38	
Clever, Inc	70	✓
Encore Technology Group	43	
Identity Automation	67	

**Score Summary Sheet**  
RFP 19-069 E - Group 1 - Single Sign On

IDM & SSO	Daryl	Jacques	Jason	Jeff	Maximo	Tonya	Average Points	
<b>Experience &amp; Qualifications (Max 10)</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	9	10	6	10	10	8	9	
Clever, Inc	10	6	8	10	10	9	9	
Encore Technology Group	9	8	8	10	10	8	9	
Identity Automation	10	9	9	10	10	9	10	
<b>Scope of Services (Max 40)</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	35	25	27	29	25	32	29	
Clever, Inc	38	17	19	22	31	28	26	
Encore Technology Group	37	34	34	33	33	31	34	
Identity Automation	40	39	36	37	37	39	38	
<b>Cost of Services (Max 20) *Calculated by PWS</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Clever, Inc	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	
Encore Technology Group	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Identity Automation	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	
<b>S/M/WBE (Max 10) **Calculated by PWS</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Clever, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Encore Technology Group	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Identity Automation	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
<b>SUBTOTAL (only 2 highest scoring vendors move on to demo)</b>						<b>Picked for Demo</b>		
ClassLink, Inc				38				
Clever, Inc				55				✓
Encore Technology Group				43				
Identity Automation				49				✓
<b>Demonstration (Max 20)</b>								
Clever, Inc	17	13	14	20	13	13	15	
Identity Automation	20	20	19	20	17	16	19	
<b>GROUP 1 - Single Sign On - Final Scores (Max 100)</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	44	35	33	39	35	40	38	
Clever, Inc	85	56	61	72	74	70	70	
Encore Technology Group	46	42	42	43	43	39	43	
Identity Automation	71	69	65	68	65	65	67	



**COST TABULATION SHEET**

RFP Number: 19-069E  
 RFP Title: IDM & SSO  
 Group 1 - Single Sign On  
 Purchasing Agent Name: Harmoni Clealand  
 Date Opened: August 8, 2018  
 Evaluation Meeting: August 29, 2018

Proposer's Name	Total Cost	Cost Evaluation Points	S/M/WBE Evaluation Points
<b>LOWEST PRICE</b>	<b>\$35,750.00</b>		
ClassLink, Inc	(Incomplete)	0	0
Clever, Inc	\$ 35,750.00	20	0
Encore Technology Group	(Incomplete)	0	0
Identity Automation	\$ 538,036.50	1	0

REMARKS:  
 BIDS RECEIVED AND PRICING EVALUATED BY:  
 Harmoni Clealand, Purchasing Agent, Procurement & Warehousing Services

**Pricing Evaluation Notes:**

According to the RFP, Section 2, paragraph 2.7, Evaluation and Award: All proposals received must meet the Minimum Eligibility Requirements as stated in Section 4.2 of the RFP in order to be further considered for evaluation... **Those proposals which meet the minimum requirements shall be further evaluated and scored by an Evaluation Committee.**

and Section 4, paragraph 4.4, Evaluation Criteria: ... Failure to respond or **incomplete responses to any evaluation criteria below will result in zero or reduced allocation of points for the criteria and may result in disqualification of entire Proposal.** Proposers submitting bids for both Group 1 and 2 shall submit separate responses..

and Section 4, paragraph 4.4.3, Cost of Services: ... Attachment K contains multiple tabs, two (2) of which separate Group 1 from 2 and tab three (3) allows proposers who are capable of offering both groups to provide bundled pricing for informational purposes only. Group 1 and Group 2 will be evaluated individually for points allocation.... **The total cost for years 1-3... will be used for calculating points. Cell C8 on Attachment K - Pricing Spreadsheet for Group 1 and Group 2 will be used to calculate points.**

and Section 5, paragraph 5.1: The Evaluation Committee (hereinafter referred to as "committee"), **shall evaluate all Proposals received, which meet or exceed section 4.2, minimum eligibility and Section 7.1, Indemnification...**

Although **ClassLink's** proposal met all minimum requirements, only bundled pricing was supplied. Therefore, the pricing cells specified above were blank. Below is a screen shot of ClassLink's Attachment K SSO document:

Company Name: **ClassLink, Inc.**

**GROUP 1 - Single Sign On (Pricing Matrix)**

**Instructions to Proposer:**

1. Price summary will be a roll-up of subsequent Price Detail sections. Price Summary shall represent the full price of implementation and ownership over the first three years and two years extension.
2. Price Detail sections shall include unit pricing and extensions as applicable. In the case of discrepancy between the two, the unit price(s) shall govern.



3. Pricing Detail sections must include ALL cost items needed to implement Vendor's proposal as required in RFP. Please add additional items as needed.  
 \*\*Include ALL costs associated to ensure that all functionality in Scope of Work is included.  
 4. All cells highlighted YELLOW need content entered by the Vendor. All other cells are formulas.

Total Cost for Years 1 through 3. (Points will be calculated using this amount) \$ -

Encore's Group 1 pricing section contains multiple "TBD" pricing cells. TBD (To Be Determined) is incomplete. Screen shot below:

Pricing Detail (Total of below is reflected in above summary)					
Description	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Extension Year 1	Extension Year 2
Recurring Solution Costs					
Annual Base Licensing Cost	\$ 225,000.00	\$ 231,750.00	\$ 238,702.50	\$ 245,863.58	\$ 253,239.48
Annual Support (Base)	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included
Annual Maintenance (Base)	Included	Included	Included	Included	Included
Annual Additional Module Costs**	TBD	TBD	TBD	TBD	\$ -
Annual Support/Maint for Additional Module**	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -

School Board of Broward County (SBBC)  
RFP 19.069E - Identity Management and Single Sign On Software Solution  
S/MWBE Participation Evaluation Worksheet  
Monday August 20, 2018

Proposer Name	Total MWBE Participation	MWBE Certificate	Type of Work to be Performed	MWBE Participation Points	Total Evaluation Points
Identity Automation	0% 0%	NO	Contract scope	0	0
Encore technology group	0% 0%	NO	Contract Scope	0	0
Clever, Inc.	0% 0%	NO	Contract scope	0	0
ClassLink	0% 0%	NO	Contract Scope	0	0
<b>Proposer Name</b>					
Identity Automation					0
Encore technology group					0
Clever, Inc.					0
ClassLink					0
					
Signature					Date



THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA  
TABULATION SHEET

RFP Number: 19-069E  
RFP Title: Identity Management & Single Sign On Software  
Group 2 - Identity Management  
Purchasing Agent Name: Karlene Grant  
Date Opened: August 8, 2018  
Evaluation Meeting: August 29, 2018

Proposer's Name	Evaluation Points	Recommended for Award
ClassLink, Inc	0	
Clever, Inc	0	
Encore Technology Group	71	
Identity Automation	76	✓



**Score Summary Sheet**  
**RFP 19-069 E - Group 2 - Identity Management**

IDM & SSO	Daryl	Jacques	Jason	Jeff	Maximo	Tonya	Average Points	
<b>Experience &amp; Qualifications (Maximum 10)</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Clever, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Encore Technology Group	9	7	8	8	8	8	8	
Identity Automation	10	9	8	10	10	9	9	
<b>Scope of Services (Maximum 40)</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Clever, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Encore Technology Group	33	28	34	36	27	33	32	
Identity Automation	40	40	37	34	36	34	37	
<b>Cost of Services (Maximum 20) *Calculated by PWS</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Clever, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Encore Technology Group	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	
Identity Automation	12	12	12	12	12	12	12	
<b>S/M/WBE (Maximum 10) **Calculated by PWS</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Clever, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Encore Technology Group	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Identity Automation	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
<b>SUBTOTAL (only 2 highest scoring vendors move on to demo)</b>						<b>Picked for Demo</b>		
ClassLink, Inc	0							
Clever, Inc	0							
Encore Technology Group	60						✓	
Identity Automation	58						✓	
<b>Demonstration (Maximum 20)</b>								
Encore Technology Group	10	11	12	12	9	11	11	
Identity Automation	18	18	15	19	17	18	18	
<b>GROUP 2 Identity Management - Final Scores (Maximum 100)</b>								
ClassLink, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Clever, Inc	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	
Encore Technology Group	72	66	74	76	64	72	71	
Identity Automation	80	79	72	75	75	73	76	

Disqualified  
Disqualified



**COST TABULATION SHEET**

RFP Number: 19-069E  
 RFP Title: Identity Management & Single Sign  
 Group 2 - Identity Management  
 Purchasing Agent Name: Harmoni Clealand  
 Date Opened: August 8, 2018  
 Evaluation Meeting: August 29, 2018

Proposer's Name	Total Cost	Cost Evaluation Points	S/M/WBE Evaluation Points
<b>LOWEST PRICE</b>	<b>\$695,452.50</b>		
ClassLink, Inc	(Incomplete)	0	0
Clever, Inc	(Incomplete)	0	0
Encore Technology Group	\$ 695,452.50	20	0
Identity Automation	\$ 1,147,583.50	12	0

REMARKS:  
 BIDS RECEIVED AND PRICING EVALUATED BY:  
 Harmoni Clealand, Purchasing Agent, Procurement & Warehousing Services

**Pricing Evaluation Notes:**

According to the RFP, Section 2, paragraph 2.7, Evaluation and Award: All proposals received must meet the Minimum Eligibility Requirements as stated in Section 4.2 of the RFP in order to be further considered for evaluation... **Those proposals which meet the minimum requirements shall be further evaluated and scored by an Evaluation Committee.**

and Section 4, paragraph 4.4, Evaluation Criteria: ... Failure to respond or **incomplete responses to any evaluation criteria below will result in zero** or reduced allocation of points for the criteria and may result in disqualification of entire Proposal. Proposers submitting bids for both Group 1 and 2 shall submit separate responses..

and Section 4, paragraph 4.4.3, Cost of Services: ... Attachment K contains multiple tabs, two (2) of which separate Group 1 from 2 and tab three (3) allows proposers who are capable of offering both groups to provide bundled pricing for informational purposes only. Group 1 and Group 2 will be evaluated individually for points allocation.... **The total cost for years 1-3...** will be used for calculating points. **Cell C8 on Attachment K - Pricing Spreadsheet for Group 1 and Group 2 will be used to calculate points.**

and Section 5, paragraph 5.1: The Evaluation Committee (hereinafter referred to as "committee"), **shall evaluate all Proposals received**, which meet or exceed section 4.2, minimum eligibility and Section 7.1, Indemnification...

Although **ClassLink's** proposal met all minimum requirements, only bundled pricing was supplied. Therefore, the pricing cells specified above were blank. Below is a screen shot of ClassLink's Attachment K SSO document:

Company Name: ClassLink, Inc.

GROUP 2 - Identity Management (Pricing Matrix)

**Instructions to Proposer:**

1. Price summary will be a roll-up of subsequent Price Detail sections. Price Summary shall represent the full price of implementation and ownership over the first three years and two years extension.
2. Price Detail sections shall include unit pricing and extensions as applicable. In the case of discrepancy between the two, the unit price(s) shall govern.

3. Pricing Detail sections must include ALL cost items needed to implement Vendor's proposal as required in RFP. Please add additional items as needed.  
\*\*Include ALL costs associated to ensure that all functionality in Scope of Work is included.  
4. All cells highlighted YELLOW need content entered by the Vendor. All other cells are formulas.

Total Cost for Years 1 through 3.  
(Points will be calculated using this amount)

\$

-

Clever's pricing proposal did not reflect the total cost of ownership, as the fees and costs assessed to SBBC vendors was not specified. Although Clever states that the fees assessed to SBBC vendors who utilize the Clever are not supposed to be passed to SBBC, several instances where SBBC's price increases from vendors once the vendor begins utilizing Clever. Therefore, pricing for this group was incomplete.



### **Zero cost to school districts**

In contrast to expensive IDM solutions, Clever's best-in-class IDM solution is offered to school districts at absolutely no charge, aside from optional implementation services. Clever has helped districts across the country save tens of millions of dollars, putting money back into mission-critical areas, like infrastructure, edtech initiatives, and teacher's salaries.

Clever is able to sustainably offer its best-in-class IDM solution at no charge thanks to its suite of other products which generate revenue for the company. For example, one product called Clever Goals allows districts to track edtech learning outcomes, while another, Clever Secure Sync, allows edtech vendors and school districts to securely exchange class rosters. The Secure Sync product is used widely by SBBC, and is also free to the school districts, but paid for by vendors who get to avoid custom integrations and realize cost efficiencies.

In this way, Clever is able to offer our IDM solution at absolutely zero cost to districts or vendors—and the tens of thousands of satisfied school users are proof-positive of the success of this approach.

School Board of Broward County (SBBC)  
RFP 19.069E - Identity Management and Single Sign On Software Solution  
S/MWBE Participation Evaluation Worksheet  
Monday August 20, 2018

Proposer Name	Total MWBE Participation	MWBE Certificate	Type of Work to be Performed	MWBE Participation Points	Total Evaluation Points
Identity Automation	0% 0%	NO	Contract scope	0	0
Encore technology group	0% 0%	NO	Contract Scope	0	0
Clever, Inc.	0% 0%	NO	Contract scope	0	0
ClassLink	0% 0%	NO	Contract Scope	0	0
<b>Proposer Name</b>					
Identity Automation					0
Encore technology group					0
Clever, Inc.					0
ClassLink					0
					
Signature					Date